

G.R.S. IX-5]

Previous references:

1923-4

File No. 71-23

(Reforms)

Serial Nos. 1

Later references.

~~Dr. Prasad~~

GENERAL AND REVENUE SECRETARIAT.

Serial Nos.

Part B for December 1923

SUBJECT

Abstract of Newspaper Criticisms regarding
the Reform Scheme.

Filed.

K. L. Pillai

5/2/1926

REPLY

(To be written on this margin.)

857

23

24

Ref

Office of the Dewan of Mysore.

NOTE.

Dated.....9...12.....1923.

As Meekai the he
made unintended
full changes of
the Reform scheme
(brief abstract)
and the collection
I wanted to be
published - the
he keeps in
of his it

Yours one well

Y

9.12

A Collection of the criticisms
is placed below. Page I contains
a Summary of the criticisms.
Page O is a Summary of the
remarks expressed with regard to the
R. A., the L. C. and the Local R. A.

Dewan.

R2
17/12

To R Rao } Spl Officer

R2
See - May 9/12 - Certificate
to be in any outside
papers are not seen
in the lot. There

Present the
Compilation to
all editors

✓

19. 12

Copies have gone to
all writers. They will be
separated such. BHO Dway
R2
19/12

R2
19/12

~~Box~~

1st Member.

seen

11/12

26/12

2nd Member

R2
27/12

640
27.12.23.

seen

✓

18/12

R2
29/12

The papers may perhaps be
like

28/12

all history

R2

21/12

Tom Owen

B.

4745
20-12-21

Ref 11-2-12

The following observations pertain to the newly constituted Representative Assembly have been made in the various newspapers:-

1. That the Representative Assembly is entrusted with enlarged functions, but the powers given to it with one hand are taken away with the other.

2. In the new constitution the major backward communities viz., the Vokkaligars the Lingayets and the Kurubars who form more than 2/5 of the population and contribute the major portion of the State Revenue have been denied their due share of representation.

3. The scheme of minority representation in the Assembly and the powers and functions of this body serve to direct public attention to the new value which it is proposed to give to its opinions and wishes.

4. The changes inaugurated in the constitution of the Assembly show that while Government have been actuated by a genuine desire to accelerate the pace of the political development in Mysore, they have fallen short of expectations. The vexed problem of minority representation in the Assembly has not been satisfactorily solved and ^{there} is a great disparity in the representation of rural and urban consti-

tuencies in the Representative Assembly.

5. The Government have departed from the Committee's recommendation in ^{regard to} the constitution of the Representative Assembly.

6. The Assembly which is the popular house, with all the benefits conferred upon it does not possess the capacity to enforce its decisions and regulate the administration.

7. The experience of ~~the~~ British India, in respect of minority representation scarcely ^{warrants} ~~warrants~~ an optimistic view regarding the success of the system.

8. The Government should not ignore the claims of minorities for adequate representation in the Representative Assembly.

9. The Assembly stands to gain by having the Dewan as its President.

10. If the Assembly in the past has been the success that it is represented to be it deserved to be given ~~to~~ a better position than that of an advisory body with no legislative power.

11. Checks and restrictions have been imposed even on the privilege of consultation granted to the Assembly.

12. The strength of the Assembly has been reduced while it is superseded by the Council.- a comparatively younger body.

13. The Government have persisted in making the Assembly an electorate for the Council though the idea was condemned.

14. All the inherent defects of the working of the Indian Reforms have been incorporated in the Mysore Reforms.

15. The numerous restrictions placed on the members of the Assembly tend to make it well-nigh impotent where issues of immediate importance are concerned.

16. The Assembly may at ^{best} ~~least~~ serve to voice the opinion of the people.

C 7

The following are the opinions expressed on the position of the Legislative Council:-

1. The Legislative Council has been reconstituted with larger powers and increased responsibilities.
2. The Legislative Council with all its powers is only meant to be a ^{Phantom} ~~phantom~~ institution. The basic fault of the Mysore Scheme is its desire to incorporate as much as possible the restrictions on popular actions which are the special characteristics of the Montford Reforms with the tendency towards progressive democracy which animates His Highness' Government.
3. Under the Mysore Reforms, the President of the Council is to be the Dewan who is the head of the Cabinet. In him are vested large powers to over-ride the wishes of legislature as the Executive is not responsible to it. To make him regulate the debates in the Council, is not likely to enhance its status or to promote the free expression of popular views.
4. The provisions of the new Legislative Council Regulation are incompatible with the spirit of age.
5. The Regulation is in the main the recommendations of the Seal Committee which have not been received with any exuberant enthusiasm.

6. The Reforms introduced in the constitution of the Legislative Council are all for the better and in some respects are in advance of those in British India.

7. The Legislative Council Regulation as well as the Representative Assembly Regulation bear traces of hasty drafting.

8. The Representative Assembly is superseded by the Legislative Council which is a comparatively younger body.

9. The Constitution of the council is hardly calculated to satisfy the public expectations and requirements, the real representatives of the people will be a minority in the Council and the reservation of power to restore provisions in the Budget disallowed by the Council is worse than the certification power invested in the Governor-General, under the INDIAN Reforms Act.

~~10. The revision of the Constitution~~

The following observation has been made on the revision of the Constitution of Local Boards:-

The revision of the constitution, power and functions of the Local Boards are the only re-deeming features of the ~~chang~~ scheme.

9
(8)

OPINIONS ON THE REFORMS.

✓ Vokkaligara Patrike
31-10-23.

States that various measures have been introduced under His Highness' benevolent - rules to ensure the happiness and contentment of His subjects; that at the top of all - these come the political reforms now sanctioned; that the two public bodies in the State have been reconstituted with larger powers and increased responsibilities for which the people should feel grateful to His Highness the Maharaja and that the plan which has ultimately been devised as most suitable in the present circumstances of the State, amidst divergent shades of opinion, should be worked in the best interests of the country.

✓ Swarajya,
29-10-23.

States that the constitutional reforms as finally sanctioned, are disappointing and unsatisfactory; that while the forms of - liberal and popular Government are there, they hardly disguise the autocracy that sits entrenched behind; that the Assembly is - widened with enlarged functions but that the powers given to it with one hand are taken away with the other; that the Legislative Council, with all its powers, is only meant to be a phantom institution and that the - basic fault of the Mysore scheme is its - desire to incorporate as much as possible, the restrictions on popular action which are the special characteristics of the - - Montford Reforms, with the tendency towards progress, democracy which animates His Highness' Government.

✓ New India.
29-10-23.

Elaborates the scheme of reforms as sanctioned by His Highness the Maharaja and states that it is in the main analogous to that in British India and that it is simpler and more liberal than that recommended by the Special Committee.

✓ New India.
1--11-1923.

See 4(2) of the L.C. Regn
See 4 of the L.C. Regn

States that under the Mysore Reforms, the President of the Assembly as well as the Council, is to be the Dewan who is the head of the Cabinet; that in him are vested large powers to over-ride the wishes of the Legislature, as the Executive is not responsible to it; that to make him to regulate the debates in the two councils is not likely to enhance their status or to promote the free expression of views in them and that the Durbar would have done better to follow the precedent set in British India, which has proved an unqualified success.

P.T.O

✓ Mysore Star.
4-11-23.

States that the reforms have not come as an un~~mixed~~ blessing to the major backward communities, namely, the Vokkaligars, the lingayets and the Kurubars; that these major ~~commu~~ communities who together form more than 2/5th of the total population of the State and contribute the major portion of the State revenues have been denied their due share of representation in the new ~~const~~ constitution; that this is due to the want of proper advocacy of their cause in the committee appointed to work out details; and that Government have betrayed a considerable lack of imagination in not realising the consequence of disenfranchising these communities summarily.

✓ Daily Post.
3-11-23.

In the first article on the subject elaborated the reforms sanctioned in the case of the Representative Assembly.

✓ do. 7-11-23.

In the second article on the subject, elaborates the interesting scheme of minority representation in the Assembly, as finally decided upon and writing of the powers and functions of this body, states that they should serve to direct public attention to the new value which it is proposed to give to its opinion and wishes.

✓ do. 13-11-23.

In the final article on the subject, refers to the changes as affecting the Legislative Council and states that the Reforms do carry constitutional development farther than has hitherto been the case; that while they may fall short of popular aspirations and lack the essentials of responsible Government, the establishment of any such system of Government pre-supposes the existence of an electorate not only sufficiently large in numbers but capable of exercising control over those who seek its suffrage; and that such an electorate is certainly not yet in sight in Mysore.

Madras Mail.
2-11-23.

Sketching the constitutional changes ultimately decided upon by His Highness' Government, states that they are marked by thoroughness, by the closeness of their connection, one with another and by the evident sincerity of their purpose to weld the hearts and political actions of the people with the Ruler; and that the scheme in its final shape is much to be preferred to that as it emerged from the hands of the Committee.

✓ Mysore Patriot.
30-10-23.

Writing ~~ka~~ of the constitutional change announced by His Highness' Government, states that they confer on the people influence without power and that while they are only calculated to increase the association of the people with the administration in the State, it would be a mistake and an unwarranted expectation to try to read into

these changes anything more than such association.

✓ Mysore Patriot.
6-11-23.

Refers to the historic back-ground of the State Council as well as of the Representative Assembly and the Legislative Council.

do. 20-11-23.

In ^{another} ~~the~~ fourth article on the subject, points out how the provisions of the New Legislative Council Regulation, bearing on the prerogative right of the Ruler are incompatible with the spirit of the age and also detrimental to the influence of the Crown.

✓ New Mysore.
3-11-23.

Sketching the changes inaugurated in the constitution of the Assembly, states that while they have been actuated by a genuine desire to accelerate the ~~pace~~ pace of the political development of Mysore, they have fallen short of expectations; that there is great disparity in the representation of urban and rural constituencies in the Assembly; and that a proper solution has not been provided for the vexed problem of minority representation in the Assembly.

✓ Mysore Chronicle.
4-11-23.

States that the reforms announced represent a distinct advance on what existed before, although the opinion of the people as expressed in conferences has not been taken into consideration; that there is no element of responsible Government in the whole scheme by reason of the fact that the Government were not faced with any insistent demand from the people for political reforms; that though in the opinion of advanced thinkers, the changes introduced are disappointing and unsatisfactory, they cannot be said to be not in the best interests of the State.

✓ The Hindu.
29-10-23.

Writing of the ~~reforms~~ reforms announced by His Highness the Maharaja, states that Government have been actuated in considering the question by a genuine spirit of pushing forward the progress of political reform; that the Regulations are in the main but the Seal Committee's recommendation which have not been received with any exuberant enthusiasm in the State; that Government have departed from the Committee's recommendation in regard to the constitution of the Assembly, that a non-official majority has been ensured in the Legislative Council and that speaking as a whole, the present measure is a distinct improvement on past conditions, although public opinion in Mysore will still feel that full justice has not yet been done to their aspirations.

Para 11 of the G.O. 27.10.23

Para 33 of the G.O.

The Hindu.
30-10-23.

Mr. Hosakoppa Krishna Rao critically examined the constitutional changes promulgated by His Highness' Government and - - argues that they have been neither conceived nor proclaimed in a liberal spirit and that the aims and aspirations of the people have not been appreciated.

✓ Sampadabyudaya.
30-10-23.

States that the new scheme of reforms cannot be said to be entirely acceptable; that it falls far short of popular demands although it is a small improvement on past conditions; that the Assembly which is the popular House, with all the benefits conferred upon it, does not possess the authoritative capacity to enforce its decisions and regulate the administration and that the scheme has however to be accepted and worked for, ~~what~~ it is worth, while at the same time agitating for further extensions of power.

✓ Justice.
1-11-23.

Writing of the political reforms sanctioned by His Highness, states that they are of an important and far-reaching character; that the Assembly has been given a definite place in the Constitution with enlarged functions, that in respect of minority representation, the Government have discarded familiar devices and fall in with the recommendation of the Seal Committee that the "facultative representation" of minorities should be adopted, that the experience of British India in this regard scarcely warrants an optimistic view regarding the success of the system; that the Government should not seek ~~to~~ to ignore the claims of minorities for adequate representation in the Assembly; that the reforms introduced in the constitution of the Legislative Council are all for the better and in some respects, are in advance of ~~the~~ those in British India and that on the whole, the reforms now inaugurated are of an advanced and liberal type.

✓ Servant of India.
8-11-23

A correspondent observes that the Royal Proclamation on the Reforms could have been less conventional and more human; that the Regulations bear traces of hasty drafting; that it is a pity that the public bodies in the State were not given an opportunity to discuss and perfect them; that nevertheless the present instalment of changes means a substantial gain from the point of view of the sober reformer; that the Assembly stands to gain by having the Dewan as its President; that though the scheme is not meant to last for ever, it rests with the people to utilise to the full the opportunities now provided and to justify the demand for more powers.

✓ United India.
16-11-23.

Elaborates the constitutional changes - - finally promulgated by His Highness' Government and expressed the hope that the people will utilise the larger opportunities for - public service and usefulness to the State now thrown open to them.

✓ Bombay Chronicle.

Extracted from the
Mysore Patriot &
13th Nov. 1923.

States that the Reforms inaugurated are not of a character to satisfy the people of Mysore, that they are grudging and betray - distrust of the people; that if the Assembly with 40 years' experience behind it has been the success that it is represented to be, it deserved better consideration, instead of being relegated to the back-ground as an advisory body with no legislative power; that the scheme of reforms as finally sanctioned does not materially differ from that of the Seal Committee; that checks and restrictions have been imposed even on the privilege of consultation granted to the Assembly; that its strength has been reduced, while it is superseded by the Council - a comparatively younger body -; that the Government have - - persisted in making the Assembly as electorate for the Council, though the idea was universally condemned; that the removal of six disqualification and the revision of the constitution, powers and functions of the local bodies are the only redeeming features of a scheme which is frankly half-hearted and in some respects retrograde.

✓ Indian Social Reformer.

18. 11. 1923.

States that the Reforms promulgated show no material improvement on the proposals of the Seal Committee; that rather than benefitting by public criticisms and by the lessons of the working of the Indian Reforms, all the inherent defects of the latter have been incorporated in the Mysore Reforms; that the numerous restrictions placed on the members of the Assembly tend to make it well nigh impotent where issues of immediate importance are concerned; that it may at best serve as the voice of the people; that the Proclamation has only reiterated in different language the trusteeship theory, without taking due count of the high level of democratic life which the people of Mysore have reached; that the constitution of the Council is hardly calculated to satisfy the public expectations and requirements; that the real representatives of the people will be in a minority in the Council; that the reservation of power to restore provisions in the budget disallowed by the Council, is worse than the certification power ~~invested~~ invested in the Governor-General under the Indian Reforms Act; and that in other respects the reforms are an improvement on the Seal Committee's recommendations.

Para 39 (2) sub-para 2 of the A.O.

3)
14
/ Swarajya. 6-12-23.

Mr. S.S. Setlur critically examines the constitutional changes recently promulgated. He states inter alia that Mysore has once for all ceased to be a Hindu Raj and has deliberately cast off the Indian constitution with its rule of Impersonal Dharma and adopted instead the European model of a "rigid constitution."

Mysore Patriot.
11-12-23.

In ^{another} ~~the first~~ article on the subject, states that the Royal Proclamation makes no reference to the ultimate goal to which the present constitutional changes should lead; that even with the limitations under which the Indian States labour responsible Government should not be difficult of achievement in those States; that with the exception of ~~the~~ a few matters relating to the Ruling Family, relations with the Paramount Power, etc., the control of -- other matters should ultimately pass into the hands of the people and that the Reforms now promulgated are in the main illiberal and far behind the times.